

Monuments and the face of time: distortions of scale and asynchrony in postcolonial Hong Kong

HELEN GRACE

...visuality itself has become such a totally open and yet totally mediated field of negotiations. Precisely because anything can instantly be transformed into an electronic virtuality and because so many of our experiences now come to us first in the form of technologically mediated images, the status of the visual as such is likely to become increasingly problematic—polysemic, unpredictable, yet unavoidable. ... How to deal with the seemingly obvious or literal appeal of the visual while being mindful of the complexity of engaging with vision?¹

It is difficult to find a better metaphor of remembrance than a vanished sound recalled.²

For some days and nights before the final Star Ferry service to the old Central terminal on Hong Kong Island in November 2006, crowds gathered to take photographs³ and in particular to bear witness to the final clock toll at midnight on November 11th.⁴ On the surface, the unprecedented numbers of photographers, both amateur and professional, were like a pack of paparazzi, chasing a celebrity to her death, since there was a sense of waiting for a significant event to occur or the imminent arrival of someone important. In this case perhaps the ‘important’ people (‘temporary celebrities’?) were simply those ordinary passengers taking the ferry, continuing to move backwards and forwards across the harbour, as testimony to an everyday practice, resisting change, but equally adapting to it and surviving.

At the same time, there was a sense that the photographers were engaged in another kind of deathwatch, like the members of a large family keeping vigil by the deathbed of an elderly and esteemed relative. And a third option exists: that this phenomenon of the frenzied proliferation of images might also be giving witness to a fresh idea of ‘Hong Kong-ness’, embodied in the Star Ferry symbol as a register of a particular form of renewed consciousness directed towards the possibilities of active citizenship—and for these proponents, this was not a ‘deathwatch’ at all, but the opposite: a battleground for the preservation of a site. Within such a consciousness, a future of ‘universal suffrage’ is imagined along with the projection of a past that is worth remembering and preserving rather than something from which it is necessary to escape.

In this essay, I want to look at the phenomenal proliferation of images at this moment of intense local mobilization and try to figure out what it might signal. We have access to many of these images via online image-sharing sites, such as YouTube,⁵ Flickr and social networking sites,⁶ though there are still thousands of images that may never surface. I am especially interested in the *act* of photography under these circumstances⁷ and what it might mean for a consideration of participatory democracy in a postcolonial context. More generally there is the question of what role the image plays in constituting historical memory in an embodied sense—especially in a city that is characterized in many ways *as* image. Here I am interested in the generation of images and their circulation as a process of self-writing within new circuits of technological exchange and the local particularities of these practices.

My essay examines the extent to which historical memory of colonial experiences is still in part materially constitutive of Hong Kong's postcolonial consciousness—and this is registered in community activism around the preservation of sites marked for demolition. What this activism produces is what I will call a *spectral monumentality*, a bringing into existence of invisible monuments—in this case, the memories of demolished structures which survive in an embodied form, supported by miniature images in the digital photographs uploaded and shared on internet sites, and small, publicly available documentary movies posted on YouTube.

The timing of the actions which followed the closure of the Star Ferry pier and the silencing of the clocktower condenses a whole series of significant dates in Hong Kong history⁸ and each of these moments in time is remembered and 'revisualized' perhaps more in the affective engagement with an emblematic *sound* as opposed to an image—the chimes of the Star Ferry clock. The focus on this site seems anachronistic because it is a mechanical clock in a city that has been a global centre of electronic watchmaking, and because its Westminster chimes provide an uncanny echo of the city's colonial legacy, which, ironically, activists are at this moment engaged in fighting to preserve.

In thinking about the excessive repetition of image-production at this moment I want to extend the discussion of time and the formation of political space which Wu Hung masterfully elaborates in his book on the remaking of Beijing,⁹ as well as consider the function of the monument more generally, via reference to the nature of iconoclasm in the post-imperial context. If time is a very general and cosmological concept, an historical construct and a phenomenon embedded in artifacts, it also has a very practical and mundane dimension in watchmaking, which, until the last decade, has been one of Hong Kong's key manufacturing industries and exports¹⁰—though now it is the second largest importer of Swiss watches in the world.

Horizontal monumentality and official iconoclasm

Hong Kong is not a city filled with monuments in the sense that Alois Riegl discusses them in his influential essay, 'The Modern Cult of Monuments: Its Character and its Origin'.¹¹ The shadow of this essay is still to be seen even in

the 1976 Hong Kong Antiquities and Monuments Ordinance, which defines monuments principally in terms of Riegl's concept of 'age value' and its distinction from 'historical value'. So it is interesting that a local activism has recently arisen to declare certain relatively contemporary structures as monuments in order to preserve them as local sites of collective memory.

If the monument is generally a static structure, marked by an imposed distance between itself and the people, a kind of 'sacral zone' which requires meditation on the nature of time,¹² there is no place for such sites in a city whose architecture already overwhelms the essential verticality of monumental space (a space, which is above all designed to diminish the spectator in the colossal form of the monument). This means that there is a very different sense in which the monumental might be understood in such a place. For example, it seems entirely appropriate that 'Statue Square' in Central is a key site for domestic workers to occupy on Sundays, but no one can remember whether there actually *are* statues in the square or who is being monumentalized.

This is because the static monuments are virtually effaced in the *dynamism* of what we might call a *horizontal* monumentality which spills onto the surrounding streets and animates the space in a more general sense, thus making highly visible—and public—a particular aspect of otherwise privatized labour and domestic space. In contrast, the horizontality of the phenomenon provides a counterpart to the *verticality* of the built environment that mostly condenses and contains the workers, making them invisible.

When monumentality takes on this horizontal form—as it does also for the Star Ferry and Queen's Pier, since these have been dynamic structures, around which a constant flow has occurred and, in that very flow, memory is contained—it is not surprising that a shift takes place in the historical roles played by the authorities and the people. It is generally a function of the authorities to produce and preserve monuments as part of the consolidation of power and representation, traditionally marking imperial processes of managing public space, and overlaying them with specifically political meanings and spatial registers of visible control. However, in Hong Kong, the public authorities have abandoned this function and, instead, this role has been taken up by sections of a re-activated civil society, so that a certain reversal of historical roles has occurred. Moments of regime change are frequently marked by a stage of iconoclasm in the demolition of disgraced monuments by crowds. What does it mean when this iconoclasm becomes official, rather than popular, and when the popular response is to fight for preservation rather than destruction?

Of course, there is no official acknowledgement that this reversal of roles has occurred because the shift is masked specifically by official denial that *monuments* are being destroyed. A simple linguistic process is involved in this masking: the refusal to grant the status of monument to the structures being claimed as such. Under the Antiquities and Monuments Ordinance (1976) designed to protect heritage, 'antiquities' specifically refers to structures and 'ruins' built 'by human agency' before 1800 (i.e. before colonialism—even though this ordinance was enacted in the late colonial period).

A ‘monument’, on the other hand, is a much more ambiguous thing; its determination is not arrived at by time, but by subjective judgement (i.e. the determination and *declaration* by the Secretary for Home Affairs, after consultation with the Antiquities Advisory Board and the approval of the Chief Executive).¹³ Extending Wu’s point¹⁴ that it was a specific decision by Mao to remake Beijing, when China was reborn, by destroying the old city, it might be observed that the destruction of Hong Kong’s built heritage by local authorities means that they are simply being rather good Maoists.¹⁵

The archive of the present

If visual representations make images disappear in clichés, it will be a matter of inventing a form of visuality that problematises the visual.¹⁶

It is a paradox of contemporary image consumption that exactly at the point when domestic television viewing is moving towards high definition and high resolution, audiences are moving towards arguably the most popular new media phenomenon, YouTube, which presents the lowest definition, lowest resolution images and yet attracts a larger audience among younger age groups because of its user-generated content. It is precisely the ‘low-res’ look of YouTube clips which allows us to say that the visual is problematized in this sphere, since every subject is abstracted by the rate of compression, and every clip becomes a kind of quotation, either by being sourced from previously existing material and re-presented or, in the case of original material, simply by being uploaded into a stream of pre-existing material. While much attention in global discussion of YouTube etc. may have focused on business models and intellectual property challenges, on censorship and site access blocks and on the number of hits generated by the most popular clips, what is of much greater interest is the capacity which the site has for local colonization.¹⁷ So we can say that sites like Flickr and YouTube, in all their temporariness, constitute ‘archives of the present’, making available material which would once have remained hidden in unedited form.

So I am interested here in the proliferation of non-official images, in which amateur, ‘prosumer’ and professional practices of image-making blur in a manic over-production, which, rather than increasing the importance of the visual, tends if anything to reduce it. This is because the image becomes less important than the *act* of production—or the act of ‘capture’—as a register of *affective* engagement in a moment of *expressiveness* having deep local significance, but which subsequently fails to be communicative, beyond the instant of production, for anyone other than those who have been involved. This non-communicability of the image stands in marked contrast to assumptions of the universality of visual language, suggesting a constitution of new private spaces, separate from generalized public space (which may merely mean a space in which people are under constant surveillance). It also suggests new relations between public and private spheres in the formulation of a politics for the present, which does not merely repeat older models of mobilization.

These issues underline the complication of post-colonial *locality* beyond the binary of colonial margin/imperial centre, since in the case of Hong Kong, it is not simply a question of the passage from one form of colonization to another, but rather of the necessity to rethink what the imperial means regionally.¹⁸ In Hong Kong one encounters an ambivalence towards China's grand global brand-making. Indeed, Hong Kong—as a specifically Chinese city—is one of the few places in the world which remains somewhat detached from the awe in which China is widely held as the last great market, the salvation/destruction of the world and the final guarantor of capital's neoliberal triumphant ascendance. And, we might add with some irony, the global victory of a transformed 'communism', which finally reveals a neat parallel between global neoliberalism and the total control once associated with 'totalitarianism' alone—in spite of the Cold War's success in manufacturing a clear distinction between the 'freedom' of capitalist 'democracy' and the 'control society' of 'communism'.

So Hong Kong is curiously located at the historically unprecedented intersection of (once) mutually exclusive worldviews, thereby occupying a position of centrality and marginality at the same time—a logical impossibility, of course, which underlines the inadequacy of the categorical distinctions usually deployed in postcolonial debate. If the period of the Cold War is marked by numerous regional insurgencies against continued colonial domination,¹⁹ in colonial Hong Kong, it was more the case of a 'guerrilla capitalism'²⁰ establishing the form of flexible manufacturing which in retrospect might be seen as a pioneering form of the global capital which currently appears to rule the world.

Young activists mobilizing around the Star Ferry actions do not carry the legacy of Cold War battles and their historical memories of Hong Kong are formed as much by images from movies as by participation in events. So forms of resistance are also changing, inspired for example by contemporary anti-globalization actions—such as protests by Korean farmers in Hong Kong in December 2005,²¹ which, in their creativity, produced what we might call a specific 'visual effect', a spectacle stimulating the desire for resistant public actions.

And so the idea of participation and resistance begins to change. Image production serves to mark a sense of presence for the image-taker in an event of a particular type, a marker of existence as an active citizen (a speaker at a Queen's Pier rally in February 2007 referred to the desire of having more than a merely economic *being* as the register of a new form of post-colonial citizenship).²² The function of memory is no longer deferred to the negative image as it was in analogue photography, but rather it becomes embodied in the participant, forming what we might call the subject's 'body-memory'.²³ 'Body memory' is not only invoked in oral history projects, which seek to recover the memory of experiences not recorded in official histories, but it implies a more spatial/proprioceptive sense of memory. This relation to the body of the person taking the image should not be seen as *prosthetic*, which already implies a supplementation, in the negative sense, but rather as *extensivity* ('a plenitude enriching another plenitude').²⁴

In the Star Ferry case, and the related Queen's Pier actions, it seems that a new Hong Kong postcolonial consciousness and sociability is at least partially constituted by the historical memory of colonial experience²⁵—but the engagement nonetheless enables a level of participation which *mobilizes* those who are active in memorializing, giving them a sense of the thrill of action, which may itself be a new experience for people who have been systematically depoliticized by colonial management of earlier conflict.

At the same time a strange new domestication of history occurs, in this era of image over-production, in the form of citizen journalism and tactical media.²⁶ The taking of images amidst everyday action blurs the distinction between significant and insignificant moments, so that every image becomes a variety of family snapshot—from the simple outing to the amateur footage of a train crash, used on the evening news, to the riot, and the overthrow of a regime. Any of these images can be recycled beyond the domestic sphere to become news footage—legitimate records of an event which official news management deems un-newsworthy. In a description of these practices, Patricia Spyer refers to what she calls 'shadow media', which she usefully defines as: 'the tangential, mobile infrastructure of a counter-discourse to conventional national and international broadcasting'.²⁷

In suggestive comments proposing an 'ethics of postvisuality', which I have used as one of my epigraphs, Rey Chow notes the reality that image production—enabled by the possession of *sight*—does not necessarily indicate anything more than the ability to afford a video camera, and certainly does not guarantee reliable knowledge or clear perception. Nor, we might add, does it usually involve conscious speculation on the nature of time, however much ubiquitous uses of new media engage with a relation to memory. Chow's observations on the possibility of a 'postvisuality' build on earlier remarks about the discipline of cinema studies, in which she comments on the propensity of the discipline (and of other humanities disciplines, such as literature and history) to focus increasingly on the particularities of group identities and identity politics, rather than the universalistic generalities conventionally associated with disciplinarity. The effect of this tendency is to make cinema studies a 'phantom discipline', in spite of its initial challenge to the bases of representational theories.²⁸

In comparing the different approaches to cinematic time in the work of Benjamin and Bazin, Chow sees Bazin's work as having a greater capacity to understand the retroactive potential of cinema than Benjamin's futurity-focused, shock-based explanation of cinematic effectivity, especially in understanding the different political uses of cinema in Hollywood and the Soviet Union (exemplified in the case of Bazin's essay on the Stalin myth).²⁹ As Chow puts it: 'The cinematic image here takes on the status of a monumentalized time, which compels one to look retroactively at something better, larger, and more glorious that no longer is.'³⁰ Bazin's work demonstrates the profoundly political value of nostalgia in inspiring action—and this suggestion of the progressive value of nostalgia goes against the orthodoxy of most accounts which see it as essentially conservative.

In considering the actions around the Star Ferry pier closure and the YouTube ‘record’ of these events, I want to suggest that a process of retroaction is one of the observable features in this development and that some of the reconceptualization of representation once undertaken by cinema studies in its challenge to older disciplines is now occurring in new and ubiquitous media technologies rather than in new media art, because the area in which these shifts are occurring is within the ‘virtual-intimate’ relation between audiences and producers rather than in the formalist/textual sphere, which has been the focus of modernist criticism. Perhaps this is why user-generated content *in itself* has not received very much attention since its *difference* is still perceived as *repetition* within critical language.

A constant theme in much of the critical/analytical work on the status of the image in the last thirty years or so has been the establishment and maintenance (or loss) of *truth value*—in the wake of poststructuralist challenges to the relation between original and copy, real and fake (a challenge embodied in the technological shift from analogical to digital photography). In general a mistrust towards or scepticism of the image lies at the heart of much of this work, but I would suggest that this mistrust and scepticism itself is now partially redundant—because the concern with *truth value* has given way to an acceptance of what I want to call ‘*face value*’: i.e. the tendency to take for granted the reality of the image, knowing however that it *is* an image, which has the capacity to both reflect and produce reality.

To explain this more clearly, I want to suggest that ubiquitous user-generated imagery may involve a different relation to time and memory than exists in the case of analogue photography. This is because the act of *presence* which it records possesses principally a performative or projective nature, rather than one of memorialization (though this is not excluded); the memorial act assumes the absolute reality of the moment recorded, inaugurating it as a register of the present, which becomes immediately the past—immediately historicized—as soon as the image is taken.

The ubiquitous image, on the other hand, has a much more tenuous link to the present, which it does not necessarily accept as real; rather, it is the act of ‘capture’ which brings the present into existence, because ubiquitous image-making belongs to a world in which the real *in itself* is so thoroughly mediated that it does not exist without at the same time producing an image of itself—and it is this image which secures the lived reality in which the image-maker is situated. This does not mean that the performative and the memorial are opposed; rather it indicates that memory is also secured via the image and, in its embodied form, is brought forth in action and performance.

We cannot yet speak of the status of these images in the future—whether they are stable enough to constitute enduring records which will enter archives and speak for the past, with what Derrida calls a ‘spectral messianicity’.³¹ Nor do we yet know what processes of selection will determine which images will survive—if the image itself *does* survive. There is also the question of the archive itself as a specifically historical form whose efficacy might now be under challenge from the sheer avalanche of

information and from emerging structures of data management based on much more associative links and networks of organization.

Between the development of image-based data systems on the one hand, and the greater mathematicization of data on the other, the archive itself is undergoing mutation. For Michel Foucault the archive is precisely ‘the law of what can be said, the system that governs the appearance of statements as unique events’.³² Its function is to structure statements/events according to particular observable regularities ordered by distinct figures intended to avoid the endless accumulation of things in a disordered mass, the mere inscription of unbroken linearity or the disappearance of significant things as a result of chance or accident. It lies ‘between tradition and oblivion’, providing ‘*the general system of the formation and transformation of statements*’.³³

This model of the archive, as Foucault describes it, clearly belongs to that order of knowledge he has termed the modern episteme (as opposed to a displaced classical order). But this very container of information can no longer so easily keep up with the rate of data flow it is required to manage, reminding us of the instability and impermanence of all human ‘technologies’ of inscription and memory systems. In the work of Friedrich Kittler, for example, a ‘control society’ version of dystopia is offered:

Increasingly, data flows once confined to books and later to records and films are disappearing in black holes and boxes that, as artificial intelligences, are bidding us farewell on their way to nameless high commands. In this situation we are left only with reminiscences, that is to say, with stories.³⁴

‘We are left only with reminiscences’

YouTube itself generates a particular narrative of the recorded events which it hosts, and this becomes apparent in watching the Star Ferry story on the site. A search for Star Ferry clips, in the context of social activism around the preservation of the site, uncovers a series of clips from the film *The World of Suzie Wong* (Richard Quine, 1960),³⁵ uploaded in September 2006, just as actions to preserve the pier were coming to wider public attention. But in this context, the film’s problematic narrative becomes irrelevant and its characters fade into the background as the background itself moves to the foreground, so that the Hollywood movie is newly available as a *documentary* of Hong Kong at the exact moment when the Star Ferry terminal was built, and the scenes of the city record an architecture and an imagined way of life which has been largely demolished.

This moment of professional movie-making with its fluid camera movements and lighting, along with its staged action and its exaggeration of life, is a brief interval in the YouTube Star Ferry narrative. The much more typical clips uploaded to the site possess very different qualities and these qualities establish an affective relation to the event by the deployment of particular aesthetic/instrumental framing choices. In outlining features of this work, I want to take these practices as seriously as those of professional movie-making in order to identify the emergence of particular patterns and styles in

ubiquitous media which are generally ignored or considered insignificant in scholarly fields which study the moving image.

There are a number of observable aspects of the uploaded clips I have analysed which more generally form the aesthetic style of ‘tactical media’,³⁶ and I want to illustrate this by referring to three clips posted by the same person, and the subtle but important differences which distinguish them.³⁷ In general, the camera is handheld, real-time is deployed, editing within a clip is rare, ambient sound is used and the focus is on action rather than on actors. This means there is an excess of camera zooms and pans—a characteristic of amateur usage, which professional filmmakers strive to eliminate. This excess has the effect of seizing the event, as if there is a desire to arrest time and place. The use of real-time achieves an extra dimension of authenticity and immersion. Clips 1 and 2 in my first example might be thought of as two takes of the same action; however, each ferry trip is unique and unrepeatable, so that it is not so much a case of repeated action, but rather the recording of another event altogether. The small distinctions between these clips indicate that we are not simply looking at ‘repetitive’ motion; rather we are noting the space in which distinction and difference themselves are constituted in relation to repetition, and we are considering more general questions of time, memory and duration.³⁸ The aesthetic of user-generated content intersects with more considered independent/professional filmmaking, emphasizing an immersive ‘atmospherics’ which *affectively* invokes memory-space.³⁹

Minimal editing means an action is followed from beginning to end—a choice which allows for rapid upload—and ‘editing’ simply involves the framing of a section of action, determined by a more or less arbitrary decision about duration, which in itself is based on technical factors of file size as much as on the nature of the action depicted (though this is certainly a factor which is of prime focus).⁴⁰ In this case, ‘editing’ consists of the framing of segments of action which unfold in front of the camera. Each segment forms an individual scene, but no literal cutting has occurred; instead we have what might be loosely called ‘continuous recording in-camera editing’.

The use of ambient sound means that sometimes image framing is subordinated to the capture of a particular sound (the tolling of the clock, the duration of an activist’s speech, etc.), so that the camera may be unfocused on a particular action on the visual track, moving arbitrarily around, while the sound track remains relatively clear and focused.⁴¹ This signals an *intention* of subsequent editing, but, at least in the space of YouTube’s ‘archive of the present’, this intent remains virtual (except to the extent that the YouTube site itself is a kind of editing deck, allowing for a combination of shots to be arbitrarily composed in sequences, brought together in the interactivity of viewing).

Focus on action rather than on actors means there are relatively few close-ups, a preponderance of mid-to-wide shots, and a narrative focus on collective rather than individual action, so that time itself appears to act upon groups of individuals—or it is objects themselves which become the actors (ferry movements, a clocktower). In clips where close-up or medium close-up framing predominates, the low-res quality of the uploaded material

abstracts the subject, resulting in the fluidity and blur of *movement*, rather than fixation upon any particular actor.⁴² This abstraction of subject matter heightens the dynamism of action scenes and is noticeably less apparent in the more nostalgic ‘journey’ or commemorative genre of Star Ferry clips, which focus on structures rather than processes.⁴³

The spectral monument

There is one particular structure, however, which is the principal ‘actor’ in many of the clips: the clocktower and, most emblematically, its chimes.⁴⁴ The disappearance of the ferry pier and the clocktower brings forth not so much an *image* of memory, but above all, a sound, a resonance which continues to echo across the space, underlining the insufficiency of the visual. This is most apparent during the final toll of the clock, when the tower is constantly lit by camera flash, a gesture of utter futility, since in the frenzy of image-making at this moment, it is as if these cameras are trying to photograph a *sound* instead of an image. As the image fades, the sound becomes the focus of meaning and the source of symbolization. It is at this point that the substance of sound also becomes apparent, since in fact it is structured by a distinct temporality of intervals between noise and silence, and by the balance of sounds—the ‘live mix’ of other urban sounds, of conversations and vehicles and the movement of traffic and people.

Of the eighty or so clips being considered here, the majority are focused on two key moments, the final toll at midnight on November 11th,⁴⁵ and the actions to prevent the pier and clocktower’s demolition in mid-December 2006.⁴⁶ The most popular clips are posted in most cases by networks of activists—though there are some popular clips posted by generally apolitical but sympathetic participants. In the most popular clip on the site, bodies replace the sound of the clock, voicing the chimes and toll, echoing another scene of ‘embodiment’ in another clip, in which an artist, in an attempt to prevent demolition, wears a clocktower costume, effectively becoming a ‘body-clock’.

The affective power of the material considered here is most keenly experienced on the level of sound and music—the resonance of atmospheric sound and carefully selected soundtrack music expressing the force of emotion in the face of official impassivity. Anita Mui’s iconic voice on the soundtrack of *Si Shui Liu Nian* [*Homecoming*] (Ho Yim, 1984) is used in two of the most realized of the clips,⁴⁷ and Hacken Lee’s very popular *Red Sun* (1992)⁴⁸ is also used. Literally more ‘resonant’, however, is the adaptation/‘remake’ of another Hacken Lee song, *Tin Shui Wai Sing* (天水圍城), one of his rare ‘political’ songs, about a neighbourhood being redeveloped. Posted after the demolition, this version, entitled *Tin Sing Wai Tsing* (天星遺情),⁴⁹ features a wordplay on the original song title, and suggests the act of a political assassination in the demolition.⁵⁰ This sense of a ‘judicial’ murder is further elaborated in probably the most conceptually developed of all the clips (though not posted on YouTube).⁵¹ This Videopower work goes in search of the remains of the clocktower, interviewing eye witnesses to the

‘assassination’, who tell the filmmakers the structure was completely destroyed within an hour of being transported by barge from Central and its remains scattered on a fill bank off Tuen Mun—establishing a sense of the official ‘killing’ of time in a seemingly anti-historical gesture.

The spectral monument is, then, a much more embodied and resonant presence, related to the historical experience of a space—but somewhat more than a mere image in the mind’s eye. The bureaucratic imagination fully understands this meaning of the structure which exudes a resonance, largely resistant to developmental plans, and it produces its own ‘spectral monuments’ as projections rather than as embodied memories (since bureaucracy at this level is amnesiacal rather than memorial). Prior to the demolition of the Star Ferry site, the Civil Engineering and Development Department ‘captured’ every detail of the clocktower’s appearance, using elaborate laser scanning technology to construct detailed ‘point cloud’ images, in order to produce very attractive 3D animations for presentations to engineers and other officials.⁵² The specifically *projective* purpose of this techno-image-making is to introduce ‘preservation elements’ into future engineering projects; historical memory thus becomes simulation, a veneer which can be added to the surface of a building to deal with the increasing irritation of community objections to planning decisions. Additionally, the styles and genres and power and influence of popular entertainment require that bureaucrats must also be, at the very least, entertaining in order to implement change without objections.⁵³

The face of time

To think in greater detail about the meaning of the spectral monument which the Star Ferry has become, I now want to turn to Wu Hung’s discussion of ‘political space’, not simply as a conceptual sphere of public discourse or a physical space where public events occur, but rather as the architectonic embodiment of political ideology and a site for activating political action and expression.⁵⁴

In his simultaneous project of historical research and memory formation, Wu relies upon Maurice Halbwachs’ notion of memory as collectively, rather than individually, formed,⁵⁵ and in the chapter of the book most directly relevant to the subject here, he explores the relation between the formation of political space and public time, by focusing on the giant digital ‘Hong Kong clock’ placed on the façade of the Museum of History in Tiananmen Square in 1986—the first new ‘structure’ placed in the square since 1977 (the year of the establishment of Mao’s Memorial Hall, which signalled the end of the Cultural Revolution). The clock (removed in 1997, having completed its purpose) counted down the days and seconds until the handover, but the very digitality of its time registration created the sense of rapid disappearance of the present, and the inevitability of the rapidly approaching future—a future in which the Chinese government’s resumption of sovereignty over Hong Kong would become ‘eternal’, and its Utopian project would be realized. In this ‘timeless’ space politics effectively becomes religion.

The modern temporality measured by this *visual* display of time stood in marked contrast to the *sonic* spatiality of historical Beijing's imperial landscape, a territory framed not by the public square in front of Tiananmen, but by the space behind the Forbidden City, bound by the two tallest structures on the central axis—and the only two structures in Ming-Qing Beijing which could be called 'public monuments': the Drum Tower and the Bell Tower. Wu notes the distinction between accounts of these structures in official documents, which associate them with visuality, and accounts in memoirs and folk tales which note their acoustic dimension.⁵⁶ The historical function of this 'resonant' axis was to ritualize the official marking of time, between day and night, between work and rest and the opening and closing of the city gates. The *sound* of drums and bell then signified the eternal repetition of time itself, ordered by the emperor, whose control of the knowledge of time guaranteed the harmony of time and space necessary to the rulership of a unified state—before the ways of knowing and time-telling were challenged by mechanical clocks and the emergence of a new form of political time-space in which the Western clocktower would become emblematic of a new social-technical system.⁵⁷

As previously noted, the Hong Kong clock was not a mechanical clock, but a digital one—signifying the modernity of its technology, precisely as a product of Hong Kong, where the majority of quartz watches were made from the 1970s. Wu refers to a comment by Ackbar Abbas that the acknowledgement of Hong Kong's technological superiority indicated an unprecedented situation in the history of colonialism, in which the 'colony' could be said to occupy a technologically more advanced position than the (prospective) 'colonising state'.⁵⁸ At the time of writing, a new countdown clock occupies the exact position where the Hong Kong clock was previously located—the Beijing Olympics clock—but if the very digitality of display in the former case references Hong Kong manufacturing industry, the new clock prominently displays the logo of the official Olympics timekeeper—the Swiss company, Omega.

Perhaps this is not so far from Hong Kong after all. As Kwai-Cheung Lo has noted, it has been suggested that Hong Kong could become the 'Switzerland of Asia'.⁵⁹ Lo begins his account of Hong Kong's transnational culture by noting a few of the similarities of the two places—their internationalism as financial centres, their assimilation of adjacent cultures while remaining separate, their position 'outside' of the continents in which they are located, their 'special status' and border porosity (for flows of capital, information and people). The comparison seems apt because one of the striking features of Hong Kong's postcolonial urban and commercial culture is the amount of space given over to the marketing of Swiss watches.

While the general excess of attention given to luxury goods—fashion, jewellery, make-up—is a visual feature of urban space in global cities, having its own counterdiscourse,⁶⁰ the Swiss watch in Hong Kong seems a special case. If we can say that colossal proportions demonstrate the incongruity between a figure and whatever concept it is being called upon to represent,⁶¹ the Swiss watch is another monumental form in Hong Kong,

another case of scalar distortion, in gigantic projections on huge billboard displays and MTR advertisements, frequently featuring celebrity endorsements,⁶² in an excess of newspaper advertisements for them⁶³ and in their close-up appearance in cinema—most notably in *Infernal Affairs*.⁶⁴

Hong Kong remains a centre of the global watch industry—though now as a place where watches are *sold* rather than made—and, especially during ‘Golden Week’ holidays, mainland tourists flock to Hong Kong, their preferred location for luxury consumption of superior watches and jewellery.⁶⁵ Between the hyper-consumption of Swiss watches, real or fake, and the hyper-production of images of a clocktower, which no longer exists except as spectral presence, a relation to time seems somehow out of joint in Hong Kong and we cannot yet tell whether the city has stepped out of history or into it.

Notes

- ¹ Rey Chow, ‘Towards an Ethics of Postvisuality: Some Thoughts on the Recent Work of Zhang Yimou’, *Poetics Today* 25(4), 2004, pp 673–688.
- ² Wu Hung, ‘Monumentality of Time: From Drum Tower to “Hong Kong Clock”’, in *Remaking Beijing: Tiananmen Square and the Creation of a Political Space*, Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 2005, pp 125–167.
- ³ To get some sense of the scale of this phenomenon, see the following video clip on YouTube, posted by Powerpix (duration 2.19 mins, posted 11 November 2006) <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YCNLtWmIjo&mode=related&search>. I will be relying on URL references to illustrate this article throughout, and invite the reader to interactively engage in the kind of hypertextual reading which the ephemeral subject of this essay requires. I will identify clips by listing YouTube user names, durations, date of posting and URL.
- ⁴ Estimates put the number on the final day at 150,000 people; Chloe Lai, ‘Last Resistance’, *South China Morning Post*, 12 June 2007, A12.
- ⁵ YouTube is the most popular site used by Hong Kong people to upload video and although some material is uploaded to servers such as sendspace.com or megaupload.com, these are temporary file storage rather than viewing sites. Photographs are uploaded to blogsites, the most important being blog.sina.com.hk, blog.yahoo.com.hk, xanga.com and [msn space](http://msn.space)
- ⁶ There are at least 7,000 images on Flickr tagged as ‘Star Ferry’; a smaller number directly deal with the events of November–December 2006; my initial interest in this material is related to research on camera phone images, but such images are not the principal focus here. In this article I have focused more on social activist material, especially YouTube—accessible clips—as well as work made by groups such as Inmedia, and I have analysed in some detail around eighty clips of various durations, from eleven minutes to less than one minute.
- ⁷ I am deliberately not making a clear distinction between the products of this action—still photography and video—because technological convergence has largely eliminated this distinction and most ubiquitous ‘capture’ devices, especially mobile phones and digital cameras, have still, still sequence and video recording capacity, and in image display technologies still images are frequently ‘animated’ in automated slide show loops. The still image thus no longer records a ‘frozen’ moment in time but is rather situated in a generalized dynamic animation of visual space.
- ⁸ Notably: the Star Ferry riots of 1966, the 1967 ‘Cultural Revolution’ riots; 1997 and its tenth anniversary in 2007; the year 1989 which intervenes in the linear series, 1966–1967–1997, and is actively remembered in June 4th candlelit vigils each year; and the huge pro-democracy march of July 1st 2003 as the city was recovering from SARS.
- ⁹ Wu Hung, *Remaking Beijing: Tiananmen Square and the Creation of a Political Space*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005.
- ¹⁰ In 1988, export value of watch production exceeded that of the toy industry and was the third most important export behind clothing and textiles and electronics. Amy K Glasmeier, ‘Flexibility and

- Adjustment: The Hong Kong Watch Industry and Global Change', *Growth and Change* 25 (Spring), 1994, p 233. Between 1994 and 2006, the size of the industry in Hong Kong declined by 90 per cent as manufacture moved to the mainland. See *Profiles of Hong Kong Major Manufacturing Industries: Watches & Clocks*, Hong Kong Trade Development Council, 19 January 2007, http://www.tdctrade.com/main/industries/t2_2_40.htm, accessed 1 May 2007.
- ¹¹ Written when he was editor of a government commission journal on the research and preservation of monuments in the late Habsburg period, as the monarchy began its fade into oblivion. See Alois Riegl, *Der moderne Denkmalkultus. Sein Wesen und seine Entstehung*, Vienna, 1903; English translation: 'The Modern Cult of Monuments: Its Character and Origin', K.C. Forster and D. Ghirardo (trans.), *Oppositions* 25 (Fall), 1982; reprinted in K Michael Hays (ed.), *Oppositions Reader: Selected Readings from a Journal for Ideas and Criticism in Architecture, 1973–1984*, New York : Princeton Architectural Press, 1998. On Riegl's significance, see especially Mike Gubser, *Time's Visible Surface: Alois Riegl and the Discourse on History and Temporality in Fin-de-siecle Vienna*, Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2006.
 - ¹² In writing about the significance of this 'sacral zone', Mikhail Yampolsky suggests that monuments are partially magical instruments in their impact on the structure of time—to the extent that their erection has the magical aim or desire of changing time's course or avoiding its influence. See 'In the Shadow of Monuments: Notes on Iconoclasm and Time', in Nancy Condee (ed.), *Soviet Hieroglyphics: Visual Culture in Late Twentieth Century Russia*, London, BFI Publishing, 1995.
 - ¹³ See Antiquities and Monuments Office, Declared Monuments in Hong Kong, <http://www.amo.gov.hk/en/monuments.php>, accessed 18 May 2007.
 - ¹⁴ Wu, *Remaking Beijing*, p 8.
 - ¹⁵ K-C Lo points out that there is a long tradition in China for almost every new regime to destroy the landmark architectures of the displaced regime in order to begin afresh, and that this response is not at all restricted to Maoism (email correspondence, 20 June 2007).
 - ¹⁶ Ackbar Abbas, *Hong Kong: Culture and the Politics of Disappearance*, Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1997, p 8.
 - ¹⁷ We cannot be too romantic about this capacity. If the business model changes or if site access is blocked, this capacity is immediately lost. But in guerrilla activity, nothing is taken for granted. By the time you read this, some of the links might already have disappeared. (A recent report suggests that access to photos of the 1989 Tiananmen crackdown on Flickr.com may be restricted in China. See 'Access to Flickr.com Blocked', *South China Morning Post*, 14 June 2007, A4.)
 - ¹⁸ For an attempt to rethink some of these questions in the case of Taiwan, see Chen Kuan-Hsing, 'The Imperialist Eye: The Cultural Imaginary of a Subempire and a Nation-State', *positions* 8(1), 2000, pp 10–76. For a more specific focus on Hong Kong, see Tak Wing Ngo, *Hong Kong's History: State and Society Under Colonial Rule*, London, Routledge, 1999; Stephen Wing Kai Chiu and Tak Lok Lui (eds), *The Dynamics of Social Movement in Hong Kong*, Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 2000; and Fred Y L Chiu, 'Politics and the Body Social in Colonial Hong Kong', in Tani E Barlow (ed.), *Formations of Colonial Modernity in East Asia*, Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1997, pp 295–322.
 - ¹⁹ See Chua Beng-Huat, 'Notes on the Cold War in Southeast Asia', *Inter-Asia Cultural Studies* 2(3), 2001, pp 481–485.
 - ²⁰ Danny Kin-kong Lam and Ian Lee, 'Geurrilla Capitalism and the Limit of Statist Theory; Comparing the Chinese NICs' (1992), cited in Kim-Ming Lee, 'Flexible Manufacturing in a Colonial Economy', in Tak Wing Ngo, *Hong Kong's History*.
 - ²¹ Jonathan Watts, 'Korean Farmers Take Lemming-like Plunge into Hong Kong Harbour', *Guardian*, 14 December 2005, <http://www.guardian.co.uk/wto/article/0,,1666892,00.html>. See also BBC and Skynews reports on the protests, uploaded to YouTube: <http://www.indymedia.org.uk/en/2005/12/330309.html>; <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PcobY7vDACc>. See also the lecture by Joseph Stiglitz at Lingnan University, 'Fair Trade for All—the Role of WTO', 12 December 2006, <http://libmedia.ln.edu.hk/media3/www/lib/05-06-2/stiglitz051212.htm>
 - ²² There is an insistence in the expression of this desire to deny the late colonial contention that the lack of an outlet for political idealism is redirected towards over-investment in the economic sphere, as Abbas claims. See Abbas, *Hong Kong: Culture and the Politics of Disappearance*, p 5.
 - ²³ See cognitive work on emotion and affect, especially Antonio Damasio, *The Feeling of What Happens: Body, Emotion and Consciousness*, London: Heinemann, 1999.
 - ²⁴ For Derrida, the 'supplement' is ambiguously located between the sense of 'a plenitude enriching another plenitude, the fullest measure of presence', and an idea that 'the supplement supplements . . . adds only to replace . . . represents and makes an image . . . its place is assigned in the structure by the

- mark of an emptiness' (*Of Grammatology*, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976, p 144). I want to suggest that the prosthetic belongs to this second sense of the supplement and that the idea of extensivity belongs to the former. For a more developed sense of what is involved here, see Wong Kin Yuen, 'Technoscience Culture, Embodiment and Wuda pian', in Meaghan Morris, Stephen Chan and Siu-Leung Li (eds), *Hong Kong Connections: Transnational Imagination in Action Cinema*, Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 2005, pp 269–286.
- ²⁵ On the mediated nature of history and memory, see Eric Ma Kit-wai, 'Hong Kong Remembers: A Thick Description of Electronic Memory', *Social Text* 58, 17(1), 1999, pp 75–91.
- ²⁶ For a discussion of 'tactical media', see Geert Lovink and David Garcia, 'The ABC of Tactical Media' (1997), <http://www.ljudmila.org/nettime/zkp4/74.htm>
- ²⁷ See Patricia Spyer, 'Shadow Media and Moluccan Muslim VCD's', in Barbara Abrash and Faye Ginsburg (eds), *9/11: A Virtual Case Book*, New York: Center for Media, Culture, and History, Virtual Case Book (VCB) Series, 2002, <http://www.nyu.edu/fas/projects/vcb/>
- ²⁸ Rey Chow, 'A Phantom Discipline', *PMLA* 116(5), 2001, pp 1386–1395.
- ²⁹ Andre Bazin, 'The Stalin Myth in Soviet Cinema', in Bill Nichols (ed.), *Movies and Methods*, Vol. 2, Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985, pp 29–40.
- ³⁰ Chow, 'Phantom Discipline', p 1389.
- ³¹ 'The archive: if we want to know what this will have meant, we will only know tomorrow. Perhaps.' Jacques Derrida: *Archive Fever: A Freudian Impression*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996, p 36.
- ³² Michel Foucault, 'The Statement and the Archive', in *The Archeology of Knowledge and the Discourse of Language*, New York: Pantheon Books, 1972, pp 129–130.
- ³³ Foucault, 'The Statement', pp 129–130 (emphasis in original).
- ³⁴ Friedrich A Kittler, *Gramophone, Film, Typewriter*, Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1999, p xxxix.
- ³⁵ URLs: <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CQejWDODMeU&mode=related&search=>; <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LrYXBnUI3Mk&mode=related&search=>; <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OyV3XqBdSpU&mode=related&search=>; <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=XB6icb1i4a0&mode=related&search=>; the first of these is the most viewed of all the material I have considered, registering over 19,000 hits since September 2006; by comparison, the most viewed of the local clips registers less than one-tenth of this rate.
- ³⁶ See Geert Lovink and David Garcia, 'The ABC of Tactical Media' (1997), <http://www.ljudmila.org/nettime/zkp4/74.htm>. This manifesto describes the *attitude* of the artists involved, and does not comment at all on the work produced, effectively reducing it to mere epiphenomenon and overemphasizing the artistic attitude, which to this extent might be seen as a continuation of romanticism characteristic of the historical avant-garde. I am not so concerned here to invoke a Kantian reevaluation of the work as aesthetic object, but I do want to describe the pattern formation of such work in order to understand its mode of operation and effectivity—as well as its affectivity.
- ³⁷ See, panmike's Clip 1: **中環天星碼頭 Star Ferry Pier Central Hong Kong 1** (duration 1.22 mins, posted 7 November 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lyQIRI3Y8tQ&mode=related&search=>; Clip 2: **中環天星碼頭 Star Ferry Pier Central Hong Kong 2** (duration 1.57 mins, posted 7 November 2006), http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=64z6DI3t_8Q&mode=related&search=; and Clip 3: **中環天星碼頭 Star Ferry Pier Central Hong Kong 3** (duration 2.57 mins, posted 7 November 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2140FnrykS8&mode=related&search=>. The first two panmike clips referred to here record similar action—the ferry leaves the pier and enters the harbour, the ferry itself providing the zoom-out.
- ³⁸ Henri Bergson, *Matter and Memory*, Cambridge: Zone Books, 1990.
- ³⁹ For an example of this practice, see Anson Mak, *One Way Street on a Turntable*, Hong Kong, 2007; this is an interesting example of work in which the rhythm of auditory space determines the rhythm of image time, the *feel* of sound, producing a sense of immersion more effectively than image alone is able to do. Anson Mak is one of the artists who has also been active in the Star Ferry events.
- ⁴⁰ See panmike's **中環天星碼頭 Star Ferry Pier Central Hong Kong 3** (duration 2.57 mins, posted 7 November 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2140FnrykS8&mode=related&search=>
- ⁴¹ See, for example, Wingchan411's **1216 人民論壇 中環舊天星碼頭 2** (duration 1.29 mins, posted 16 December 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6Hr-cka3AD0&mode=related&search=>
- ⁴² See wai0920's **中環舊天星最後一夜—另類的示威 2** (duration 1.33 mins, posted 13 November 2006), [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NAAqsByw7TY](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NAAqsByw7TY;); and yyys (Inmedia)'s **保衛天星碼頭/鐘樓運動 001** (duration 6.21 mins, posted 15 December 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JLSFfobBsNk&mode=related&search=>

- ⁴³ See spudmaster's *Star Ferry* (duration 4.03 mins, posted 23 September 2006, but dated August 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mQKbVfVdfo8&mode=related&search;> it features Anita Mui singing the soundtrack from the film *Si Shui Liu Nian* (Homecoming) (Ho Yim, 1984); holdincourt's *A Ride on Star Ferry* (duration 0.54 min, posted 23 September), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bCpP-pwFz9U&mode=related&search;> vienneng's *中環天星碼頭《深夜港灣》* (duration 4.32 mins, posted 10 November 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=s-cjhHBRfRw&mode=related&search=>, consisting of edited sequence of stills with added music.
- ⁴⁴ See koushirou's *告別中環天星碼頭 Farewell, Central Star Ferry Pier* (duration 2.41 mins, posted 11 November 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wLKd37xnKcY&mode=related&search=>—the most popular of the 'last toll' clips; there is a strong sense of immersion in the action—and a specific reference to the rarity of the mechanical clock on the YouTube page; see also nwfba54's *中環舊天星碼頭最後的鐘聲和響號告別* (duration 8.41 mins, posted 11 November 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8TfzhqkFVws&mode=related&search=>—another relatively popular clip, featuring some editing.
- ⁴⁵ See aminn613's *中環天星—最後的鐘聲* (duration 2 mins, posted 11 November 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-n3zbpt8xDk&mode=related&search=>; relatively rare tripod-mounted camera footage; Albion0217's *The Last Ring of the Edinburgh Place Pier Clocktower* (duration 2.15 mins, posted 11 November 2006), http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vC8Abo_4mvM&mode=related&search=; cyik's *Edinburgh Star Ferry Pier and the Clock Tower (1958–2006)* (duration 8.11 mins, posted 11 November 2006, but substantially edited, its title granting a life (and death) to the site, thus rendering it as a partially organic structure), http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Xhhxe_UM0ko&mode=related&search=
- ⁴⁶ See Siujimsun's *政府話一定要拆天星碼頭，真的沒有其他辦法嗎？* (duration 9.43 mins, posted 15 December 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=79F6RIM2Am4>—the most popular of the activist clips. See also ysss (Inmedia)'s *保衛天星碼頭/鐘樓運動 002* (duration 2.15 mins, posted 16 December 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-xolu6Y8QxA>—one of a series posted by Inmedia; suboabcde's *保衛天星碼頭/鐘樓運動 四十九年一晚喪* (duration 9.13 mins, posted 16 December 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JX5BvkKoOmM>—showing confrontation and demolition of tower.
- ⁴⁷ See spudmaster's *Star Ferry* (note 44 above); and tbert1's *Central Star Ferry Pier — The Last Moment* (duration 5.26 mins, posted 19 November 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8w60QsfP-yE&mode=related&search=>
- ⁴⁸ See chanhoyin1996's *天星碼頭(修改版)* (duration 4.49 mins, posted 13 November 2006), <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=esXDJLwBOHo>; this is a heavily edited 'music video'.
- ⁴⁹ See wookamwing's *天星遺情 結他版* (duration 3.52 mins, posted 18 January 2007), http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_JN65ZAicY
- ⁵⁰ 縱竭盡全力 We have tried our best, / 難阻決定這殺令惡極 but we cannot stop the evil of this killing order.
- ⁵¹ <http://www.videopower.hk/archive/m07.htm>
- ⁵² See Dominic Siu and Lesly Lam, *3D Modelling of Star Ferry Pier by Laser Scanning Technology*, Hong Kong: Civil Engineering and Development Department, Government of Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, http://www.fig.net/pub/fig2007/papers/ts_6f/ts06f_03_wai_lam_1324.pdf
- ⁵³ 'Engineers can even make use of 3D models to explain the project details to the public and for reference by bureaux, which allows various large-scale civil engineering projects to be implemented with ease.' Siu and Lam, *3D Modelling of Star Ferry Pier*, p 16.
- ⁵⁴ Wu, *Remaking Beijing*, p 9.
- ⁵⁵ Maurice Halbwachs, *On Collective Memory*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992.
- ⁵⁶ Wu, *Remaking Beijing*, p 138.
- ⁵⁷ On the history of time keeping, time telling and time watching, see David S Landes, *Revolution in Time: Clocks and the Making of the Modern World*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.
- ⁵⁸ Wu, *Remaking Beijing*, p 161.
- ⁵⁹ By Wang Zhan, General Director of the Development Research Center of the Shanghai Municipal People's Government; see Kwai-Cheung Lo, *Chinese Face-Off: The Transnational Popular Culture of Hong Kong*, Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 2005, p 1.
- ⁶⁰ See, for example, Hsiao-hung Chang, 'Fake Logos, Fake Theory, Fake Globalization', *Inter-Asia Cultural Studies* 5(2), 2004, pp 222–236.
- ⁶¹ Jacques Derrida, *Truth in Painting*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987, p 136.

- ⁶² Including Andy Lau as ‘ambassador’ for Cyma’s ‘Intelligentsia’ range, <http://menweilanse.blog.163.com/blog/static/5573992200672643630/>, accessed 8 June 2007; <http://www.imagemagazine.com.hk/issued/other8.html>, accessed 8 June 2007.
- ⁶³ The day before the Star Ferry closing, the *South China Morning Post* carried a twenty-four-page broadsheet advertising feature section on luxury Swiss watches and timepieces. *South China Morning Post*, 10 November 2006.
- ⁶⁴ A Chronoswiss sponsorship deal has all the main actors of *Infernal Affairs* wearing different watches as markers of the characters they play; see <http://www.watchbus.com/modules.php?name=News&file=article&sid=198>, accessed 30 May 2007. For a more considered discussion of time in *Infernal Affairs*, see Gina Marchetti, ‘Forgotten Times: Music, Memory, Time and Space’, in *Andrew Lau and Alan Mak’s Infernal Affairs—The Trilogy*, Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 2007.
- ⁶⁵ In April 2007, a CCTV journalist went undercover in a shopping tour group to reveal scams aimed at mainland tourists. Hong Kong tourism authorities were forced into damage control. See ‘CCTV Reporter Forced To Hand Over Her Video Tape’, http://www.zonaeuropa.com/20070413_2.htm, accessed 10 June 2007; ‘Yoeng Si Zi Hung Gong Zyu Bou Dim Maai Gaa Fo’ [CCTV reports HK jewellery shop selling fake products], *Hong Kong Economic Times*, 2 April 2007; ‘Sip Sau Gaa Bui, Wong Sat Zou Fung Saat’ [Suspected of selling fake watches, Majestic’s watches seized], *Mingpao*, 6 April 2006; Danny Mok and Dennis Eng, ‘400 Watches Seized in Customs Raid’, *South China Morning Post*, 6 April 2006.